

EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Sub-Committee **Date:** 1 July 2015
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook **Time:** 7.30 - 9.28 pm
Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA

Members Present: J Hart (Chairman), N Wright (Vice-Chairman), K Chana, H Kauffman, J Knapman, A Lion, H Mann, L Mead, C P Pond, C C Pond, S Watson, S Weston and D Wixley

Apologies: K Angold-Stephens, R Jennings, G Mohindra, A Patel, C Roberts, B Sandler, T Thomas and L Wagland

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), J Leither (Democratic Services Assistant), T Carne (Public Relations and Marketing Officer) and A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer)

6. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

7. MINUTES

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the last meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 3 June 2015 be agreed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

8. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

(a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Conduct, Councillor J Hart declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda. The Councillor advised that he lived in Stradbroke Grove but that he was not close enough to be consulted by the Council and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon.

- EPF/0455/15 – 54 Stradbroke Grove, Buckhurst Hill

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Conduct, Councillor H Kauffman declared a non-pecuniary interest in the following item of the agenda. The Councillor advised that he was known to the applicants and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application but would not vote.

- EPF/1051/15 – 78 Princes Road, Buckhurst Hill

9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no urgent business for consideration by the Sub-Committee.

10. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 9 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

11. PROBITY IN PLANNING - APPEAL DECISIONS, 1 OCTOBER 2014 TO 31 MARCH 2015

The Sub-Committee received a report regarding Probity in Planning – Appeal Decisions for the period 1 October 2014 to 31 March 2015.

In compliance with the recommendation of the District Auditor, the report on the agenda, Item 8, advises the decision-making committees of the results of all successful allowed appeals (i.e. particularly those refused by committee contrary to officer recommendation). The purpose was to inform the committee of the consequences of their decisions in this respect and, in cases where the refusal is found to be unsupportable on planning grounds, an award of costs may be made against the Council.

Since 2011/12, there have been two local indicators, one of which measures all planning application type appeals as a result of committee reversals of officer recommendations (GOV08) and the other which measures the performance of officer recommendations and delegated decisions (GOV07).

Over the six-month period between 1 October 2014 and 31 March 2015, the Council received 40 decisions on appeals (38 of which were planning related appeals, the other 2 were enforcement related).

GOV07 and 08 measure planning application decisions and out of a total of 38, 14 were allowed (36.8%). Broken down further, GOV07 performance was 6 out of 29 allowed (20.68%) including one part-allowed/part-dismissed and GOV08 performance was 8 out of 9 (88.88%), although out of this 8, one was part-allowed/part-dismissed.

Whilst performance in defending appeals at 36.8% appears high, there was no national comparison of authority performance. Members were reminded that in refusing planning permission there needs to be justified reasons that in each case must be not only relevant and necessary, but also sound and defensible so as to avoid paying costs. This was more important now than ever given a Planning Inspector or the Secretary of State can award costs, even if neither side has made an application for them. Whilst there is clearly pressure on Members to refuse in cases where there are objections from local residents, these views (and only when they are related to the planning issues of the case) are one of a number of relevant issues to balance out in order to understand the merits of the particular development being applied for.

RESOLVED:

That the report regarding Probity in Planning – Appeal Decisions 1 October 2014 to 31 March 2015 be noted.

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank

Report Item No: 1

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0395/15
SITE ADDRESS:	52 Sparelease Hill Loughton Essex IG10 1BT
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Replacement boundary wall to front of property and relocation of pedestrian entrance.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573887

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Brickwork to be used on the boundary wall hereby approved shall match or be similar to that used on the existing dwelling, and the railings and gates hereby approved shall be painted in a black colour.
- 3 No development, including works of demolition or site clearance, shall take place until a Tree Protection Plan Arboricultural Method Statement and site monitoring schedule in accordance with BS:5837:2012 (Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction - recommendations) has been submitted to the Local Planning Authority and approved in writing. The development shall be carried out only in accordance with the approved documents unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.
- 4 No development shall take place until details of the landscaping of the site, including retention of trees and other natural features and including the proposed times of proposed planting (linked to the development schedule), have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved landscaping shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and at those times.

Report Item No: 2

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0410/15
SITE ADDRESS:	41 Alderton Hill Loughton Essex IG10 3JD
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Alderton Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Erection of part one and part two-storey rear extension, a two-storey side extension, a two-storey front extension, raising of roof by 60 cm, and provision of two rear dormer windows.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573902

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its bulk, height and proximity to the site boundary, the proposed side extension, together with the proposed increase in roof height, would give the house an excessively bulky and over-dominant appearance in relation to its immediate neighbours. As a consequence, the proposal would detract from the street scene causing significant harm to the character and appearance of the locality. The proposal is therefore contrary to Local Plan and Alterations Policies CP2 (iv) and DBE10, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2 By reason of its height, bulk and rearward projection adjacent to the site boundary with 43 Alderton Hill, the proposal would appear excessively overbearing when seen from 43 Alderton Hill. It would therefore be excessively harmful to the living conditions of 43 Alderton Hill, contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policy DBE9, which is consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

A significant revision to achieve a less bulky design that does not significantly project rear of the first floor rear elevation of 43 Alderton Hill at upper level is suggested as a basis for a more acceptable proposal.

Report Item No: 3

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0427/15
SITE ADDRESS:	29 Alderton Hill Loughton Essex IG10 3JD
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Alderton Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of existing house and construction of a new two storey house with accommodation in the roof, including provision of balcony at first floor rear, and erection of new gates and railings on the front boundary.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=573954

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 The development hereby permitted will be completed strictly in accordance with 9 plans numbered 1097-PL-20A; -21A; -22A; -23A; -25A; -11A; - 15A; -12B; -02.
- 3 No construction works above ground level shall take place until documentary and photographic details of the types and colours of the external finishes have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority, in writing. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
- 4 No development shall take place until details of the landscaping of the site, including retention of trees and other natural features and including the proposed times of proposed planting (linked to the development schedule), have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved landscaping shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and at those times.
- 5 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 6 There shall be no discharge of surface water on to the highway.

- 7 No unbound material shall be used in the surface treatment of the vehicular accesses within 6 metres of the highway boundary.
- 8 No development, including works of demolition or site clearance, shall take place until a Tree Protection Plan Arboricultural Method Statement and site monitoring schedule in accordance with BS:5837:2012 (Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction - recommendations) has been submitted to the Local Planning Authority and approved in writing. The development shall be carried out only in accordance with the approved documents unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Report Item No: 4

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0455/15
SITE ADDRESS:	54 Stradbroke Grove Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5PF
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Two storey side and rear extension.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574034

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 5

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0530/15
SITE ADDRESS:	34 Barrington Green Loughton Essex IG10 2BA
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Broadway
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of single storey flat and redevelopment to provide 3 flats in a three storey building with accommodation within the roof and provision of 1 parking space at the rear and 3 off street parking spaces at the front with one space allocated to the adjoining dwelling at number 36 (amended scheme to EPF/2526/14)
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574214

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its bulk, spread of development and siting, the proposal would appear cramped within the site, in contrast with the character and appearance of the locality and harmful to the interests of visual amenity of both neighbours and the wider locality. As a consequence, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2(iv), CP7, DBE1(i) and DBE2, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

Any development of the site is likely to be considered more favourably if it were restricted in its height and limited in its footprint to the footprint of the existing building.

Report Item No: 6

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0728/15
SITE ADDRESS:	Lucas McMullen 258 High Road Loughton Essex IG10 1RB
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Provision of additional floor to provide 9 apartments (1 x studio, 7 x 1 bed, 1 x 2 bed). (Revision to EPF/2379/14)
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574714

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 The proposal fails to demonstrate the proposed refuse storage arrangements are practical. The inadequate provision of refuse storage arrangements is likely to be harmful to the amenities of the locality and the living conditions of the proposed flats. As a consequence, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies DBE2 and DBE9, which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 2 By reason of its siting within close proximity to the discharge point of odour extraction equipment serving the restaurant at the ground floor of 258 High Road, the proposal would result in the provision of dwellings that would be highly exposed to unpleasant odours. The new dwellings, particularly Flats 8 and 9, are therefore likely to have poor living conditions. In this particular case it is not possible to deal with this matter in planning conditions because third parties have control over it and have made clear they will not give their required consent for any necessary alterations to the extract equipment. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations Policy DBE9, which is consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

A revised proposal that provides for a demonstrably reliable means of refuse storage that, preferably does not rely on mechanical compaction of waste, and which also provides for a demonstrably achievable means of mitigating exposure of the dwellings to unpleasant odours, is likely to address the Council's objections to the proposal.

Report Item No: 7

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0749/15
SITE ADDRESS:	2A Summerfield Road Loughton Essex IG10 4QD
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton Forest
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Erection of a front boundary wall with metal railing above with a combined height of 1.8m. Metal automated sliding gate. (Amended design to EPF/2973/14).
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=574797

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its height and detailed design, the proposed front boundary treatment would appear excessively over-dominant and fail to respect its setting. As a consequence, the proposal would be harmful to the character and appearance of the locality. Moreover, should consent be given for the proposal it would be a material consideration of significant weight in favour of other similarly harmful development in the locality, which would exacerbate the harm caused. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to Local Plan and Alterations policies CP2 (iv) and DBE1 which are consistent with the National Planning Policy Framework.

WAY FORWARD

A proposal of much reduced height, approximately 1 metre in height, is likely to address the Council's objections to the proposal.

Report Item No: 8

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0891/15
SITE ADDRESS:	2 The Greens Close Loughton Essex IG10 1QE
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Johns
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	First floor side extension. New front porch. Conversion of garage into habitable room. Single storey rear extension with 1 no. roof lantern.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=575175

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 9

APPLICATION No:	EPF/1051/15
SITE ADDRESS:	78 Princes Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5DZ
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Ground and first floor rear extensions.
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/NIM_websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=575693

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 3 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.